

## Short-Answer Question 2

“None of Nature’s landscapes are ugly so long as they are wild.”

John Muir, 1901

“I recognize the right and duty of this generation to develop and use the natural resources of our land; but I do not recognize the right to waste them, or to rob, by wasteful use, the generations that come after us.”

Former president Theodore Roosevelt, 1910

2. Using the excerpts, answer (a), (b), and (c).
- a) Briefly explain ONE implication for public policy of John Muir’s view on land use.
  - b) Briefly explain ONE way in which an implication for public policy of Theodore Roosevelt’s view contrasts with the implication for public policy of Muir’s view.
  - c) Identify ONE specific example of land use policy in the United States from 1890 to 1945 and briefly explain how the example is consistent with the view of either Muir or Roosevelt.

Unauthorized copying or reuse of  
any part of this page is illegal.

-26-

**GO ON TO THE NEXT PAGE.**

## Curriculum Framework Alignment and Scoring Guidelines

---

<b>Learning Objectives</b>	<b>Historical Thinking Skills</b>	<b>Key Concepts</b>
<b>GEO-1.0</b> Explain how geographic and environmental factors shaped the development of various communities, and analyze how competition for and debates over natural resources have affected both interactions among different groups and the development of government policies.	Contextualization	7.1 II

---

**AP<sup>®</sup> UNITED STATES HISTORY  
2015 SCORING GUIDELINES****Short Answer Question 2**

0–3 points

Score 3

Response accomplishes **all three** tasks set by the question.

Score 2

Response accomplishes **two** of the tasks set by the question.

Score 1

Response accomplishes **one** of the tasks set by the question.

Score 0

Response accomplishes **none** of the tasks set by the question.

Score —

Is completely blank.

**SCORING NOTES**

a) Explains ONE implication for public policy of John Muir’s view on land use.

- Preservation/preservationists (students must explain the implications of this term)
- Formation of preservationist organizations and movement to preserve the land in its natural state
- Engendered idea of worth in natural beauty of landscape and preservation in natural state as having social value that trumped economic value

b) Explains ONE way in which an implication for public policy of Theodore Roosevelt’s view contrasts with the implication for public policy of Muir’s view.

- Conservation/conservationists (students must explain the implications of this term)
- Formation of movement at federal level, supported by progressive ideals and presidents, to conserve the land (intelligent use)
- Social value in the conservation of land and resources, with eye toward sustainability over time, but also the need to manage the resources provided by the land to best balance the benefit to society with social and economic values
- Square Deal: a pro-business or pro-development outlook can coexist with conservationist views (Theodore Roosevelt’s 3Cs: consumer protection, control of corporations, and conservation)

c) Identifies ONE specific example of land use policy in the United States from 1890 to 1945 and briefly explains how the example is consistent with the view of either Muir or Roosevelt.

- Establishment of national park system, national monuments, national historic sites and archaeological sites (Antiquities Act; National Park Service) — Muir.
- Managed use of the land (Newlands Reclamation Act; Civilian Conservation Corps; Agricultural Adjustment Acts), regulations of land use to allow but control impact of mining, logging, water use, etc. — Roosevelt.

**AP<sup>®</sup> UNITED STATES HISTORY  
2015 SCORING GUIDELINES****Short Answer Question 2 (continued)**

- Infrastructure projects designed to balance managed use of the land with preservation; these were more consistent with Roosevelt: hydroelectric dams, etc. (Hetch Hetchy; Hoover Dam; Tennessee Valley Authority).
- Growth of movement (e.g., Roosevelt or Muir) to preserve land and prevent exploitation and abuse of natural resources and environment, whether through federal regulation and establishment of federal agencies (White House Conference on Conservation; Department of the Interior; U.S. Fish Commission) or the organization of nonprofit private organizations like the Sierra Club.
- Land use policy examples must be from within time period 1890-1945; student must indicate “founding of a national park system” or other policy, beyond merely name-dropping specific national parks (for example, Yellowstone and Yosemite were both established before 1890).

## Student Responses

## Sample SA-2A

Use a blue or black pen only for the short-answer questions. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

## QUESTION 2

John Muir's view on land was that it should be untouched, regardless of what resources are on it. This could affect the government and public by stopping them from making all land industrialized. Teddy Roosevelt's view was similar to Muir's in certain ways. Teddy wanted to preserve the land but obtain possible resources on the land first. He wanted to keep the environment safe, but also keep the economy going. Seeing as Teddy was a well-known president, he could change laws and make much of the people who liked him agree to his ideas. And that is exactly what Teddy did. During Teddy's political career, he created the National Park Service, or NPS for short. This took certain areas of land and put them aside for preservation and protection under the National Government. This went along with Muir's ideas, how land should be and stay untouched. And even though Teddy wanted the resources off first, he let Muir's ideas persuade him not to do it.

## Sample SA-2B

Use a blue or black pen only for the short-answer questions. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

## QUESTION 2

a) One implication of John Muir's view on land use would be <sup>strict</sup> government regulation on the ~~conservation~~ preservation of nature. This might include reservations, parks, and areas where man does not win 'Nature's Landscapes'.

b) The implication of Roosevelt's view is different from that of Muir's because Roosevelt stresses less on preservation, but stresses conservation and using limited amounts of natural resources. In addition, Roosevelt's view supports government standards for the use of natural resources.

c) The ~~Clean~~ <sup>Clean</sup> Air and Clean Water Act would need to create more regulation on natural resources. This would support Roosevelt's view of conservation of resources and the quality of them.

## Sample SA-2C

Use a blue or black pen only for the short-answer questions. Do NOT write your name. Do NOT write outside the box.

**QUESTION 2**

a) John Muir's perspective on land use was to use it for natural resources and development of new homes to spread expansion. He did not want to conserve the land, unlike Teddy Roosevelt. He only wanted to use it for economic use.

b) Roosevelt wanted to conserve the land, not only for natural resources, but he wanted to keep them looking nice and presentable. Roosevelt wanted to save the land and the trees from being torn down.

c) During Roosevelt's presidency, he issued a Forest Reserve Act that helped ~~preserve~~ preserve the forests from destruction. Roosevelt was a major advocate for the conservationist movement.



## Scores and Commentary

Note: Student samples are quoted verbatim and may contain grammatical errors.

### Overview

Short-answer question 2 asks students to explain the differences between John Muir's and Teddy Roosevelt's views and identify a way that one of their perspectives affected land use policy.

### Sample SA-2A

#### Score: 3

- a. 1 point: The response earns the point by explaining how Muir's position would lead to a ban on economic activities on restricted land.
- b. 1 point: The response earns the point by contrasting Muir's belief in leaving land untouched with Roosevelt's willingness and ability to exploit protected lands and resources for economic reasons.
- c. 1 point: The response earns the point by identifying and correctly explaining how the foundation of the National Park Service reflected Roosevelt's views.

### Sample SA-2B

#### Score: 2

- a. 1 point: The response earns the point for accurately explaining Muir's intentions as a preservationist.
- b. 1 point: The response earns the point by offering clear distinctions between the approaches of Muir and Roosevelt; for example, explaining that Roosevelt's more active view of land use implied government regulations.
- c. 0 points: The response does not earn the point because it fails to identify a specific example of land-use policy in the time period. The Clean Air and Clean Water Acts that are referenced fall well outside the time period 1890–1945.

### Sample SA-2C

#### Score: 1

- a. 0 points: The response does not earn the point since it misinterprets Muir's approach as implying that land should be used for economic purposes.
- b. 0 points: The response does not earn the point for contrasting perspectives because it misunderstands Roosevelt's perspective as meaning that the land should be "nice and presentable" and does not state Muir's views at all.
- c. 1 point: The response earns the point for accurately referring to the 1891 conservationist Forest Reserve Act and explaining it as consistent with Roosevelt's views.